Hawaii and other Pacific hotspots: what do they tell us about the deep mantle

Cinzia Farnetani Institut de Physique du Globe de Paris, France

in collaboration with: A.W. Hofmann and C. Class Lamont Doherty Earth Observatory of Columbia University, NY, USA

W Contaking P

S The hawaiian hotspot : a long-lasting intraplate magmatism



Volcano lifetime

Loihi ~0.2 t Kilawea ~0.6 t M. Loa ~0.8 t M. Kea ~0.9 t Hualalai

S The most vigorous hotspot

Mauna Kea

Kilauea

oi

Mauna Loa

Kohala

V ~ 60000 km³ Summit elev. ~ 3.6 km Basal radius 60 km

[Hawaii Mapping Research Group]

Volcano lifetime

Loihi ~0.2 t Kilawea ~0.6 t M. Loa ~0.8 t M. Kea ~0.9 t Hualalai

Kohala Kohala

Mauna Kea

Kilauea

§ Where is the Hawaiian

Mauna Loa

V ~ 60000 km³ Summit elev. ~ 3.6 km Basal radius 60 km

[Hawaii Mapping Research Group]

Deep mantle plumes and convective upwelling beneath the Pacific Ocean Nicholas Schmerr^{a,b,*}, Edward Garnero^b, Allen McNamara^b

^a Department of Terrestrial Magnetism, Carnegie Institution of Washington, 5241 Broad Brand Road NW, Washington, DC 20015, USA

^b School of Earth and Space Exploration, Arizona State University, P.O. Box 874104, Tempe, AZ 85287, USA



Use SS precursors to map the thickness of the transition zone

They find a thinned transition zone South of Hawaii

Seismic Imaging of Transition Zone Discontinuities Suggests Hot Mantle West of Hawaii

Q. Cao,¹* R. D. van der Hilst,¹* M. V. de Hoop,² S.-H. Shim¹





Seismic Imaging of Transition Zone Discontinuities Suggests Hot Mantle West of Hawaii

Q. Cao,¹* R. D. van der Hilst,¹* M. V. de Hoop,² S.-H. Shim¹



However, according to Cao et al., the 'feeding zone' of the Hawaiian plume is displaced ~1500 km to the West, (i.e., zone III).

The 660km is deeper because of the majorite garnet-perovskite transition.

Surface lavas cannot be used to map geochemical domains in the lower mantle !

Seismic Imaging of Transition Zone Discontinuities Suggests Hot Mantle West of Hawaii

Q. Cao,¹* R. D. van der Hilst,¹* M. V. de Hoop,² S.-H. Shim¹





Some warnings :

1) Do seismologists agree with Cao et al. analysis ?

2) The dynamics is missing.

How to physically connect the ponded material to the zone of active volcanism ?

How to explain the high Hawaiian buoyancy flux (B~8000 kg/s) ?

Mantle Shear-Wave Velocity Structure Beneath the Hawaiian Hot Spot

00 03 07

Cecily J. Wolfe,¹* Sean C. Solomon,² Gabi Laske,³ John A. Collins,⁴ Robert S. Detrick,⁴ John A. Orcutt,³ David Bercovici,⁵ Erik H. Hauri²



§ Depth< 400km: low-velocity anomaly elongated in the direction of the island chain § 400- 660 km: low velocities continue downward

§ 900-1500 km : low velocities, over a region several hundred-kilometer-wide, southeast of Hawaii : a continuous, tilted plume conduit.

§ Conclusions confirmed by P-wave velocity structure [Wolfe et al., EPSL 2011].

§ The two Hawaiian volcanic chains are geochemically distinct



§ This suggests a 'bilateral' zonation of the plume conduit



Loa type source: contains recycled crust and sediments Kea type source: contains recycled lower oceanic crust and lithospheric mantle

§ The 'bilateral' zonation is NOT unique to Hawaii ! § It is best revealed by parallel volcanic chains



Huang et al., 2011 The bilateral zonation may well be a common feature of other Pacific hotspots.



Hart et al., EPSL, 2004



§ First observation :

For Hawaii and Samoa, the volcanic chain to the North (i.e., Kea, and Vai) has lower ²⁰⁸Pb*/²⁰⁶Pb* than the chain to the South (i.e., Loa, and Malu).

Huang et al., Nature Geosc. 2011



What is the 'radiogenic lead ratio' $^{208}Pb^* / ^{206}Pb^*$?

$${}^{208}\text{Pb}^{\star}/{}^{206}\text{Pb}^{\star} = \frac{({}^{208}\text{Pb}/{}^{204}\text{Pb})_{\text{sample}} - ({}^{208}\text{Pb}/{}^{204}\text{Pb})_{\text{primordial}}}{({}^{206}\text{Pb}/{}^{204}\text{Pb})_{\text{sample}} - ({}^{206}\text{Pb}/{}^{204}\text{Pb})_{\text{primordial}}}$$

It reflects the ratio of ²³²Th/²³⁸U integrated over the Earth's history.



What is the origin of the isotopic difference between parallel volcanic chains ?

Opposing answers:

- (i) Because of shallow, sublithospheric, melting processes.
- (ii) Because of large-scale heterogeneities in the deep mantle.

'Shallow origin' models



- § The topographic relief at the base of the lithosphere induces differential melting beneath Kea and Loa-track volcanoes.
- **§ Plume: mixture of peridotite + fertile pyroxenite**
- **§** A thinner lithosphere beneath the Kea-track causes higher melt fractions and more sampling of isotopically depleted peridotite.



Higher melt fraction for Kea-track volcanoes?



La is inversely proportional to the melt fraction (F).La/Yb is not significantly affected by fractional crystallization.

At a given F, pyroxenite-derived melts should have higher La/Yb than peridotite-derived melts.

Kea-track volcanoes

Ballmer's model: thin lithosphere, high melt fractions, more sampling of peridotite.Expect:Iow La,Iow La,Iow La/Yb

Loa-track volcanoes

Ballmer's model: thick lithosphere, lower melt fractions, more sampling of pyroxeniteExpect:high La,high La,high La/Yb

'Deep origin' models

At 2800 km depth § Look at seismic velocity anomalies in the lower mantle Hawaii Weis et al., 2011 Loa side samples isotopically enriched material from the edge of the 'Large Low **Shear Velocity Province'** shear velocity variation from 1-D +2% -2% Ritsema et al., 2010 Hawaii Loa Kea A' δVs ~ -3.5% Weis et al., Nature Geosc., 2011 **Central Pacific** 1000

What is the origin of the isotopic difference between parallel volcanic chains ?

§ Large-scale heterogeneities in the deep mantle.

§ The geochemical province known as 'DUPAL anomaly' [Dupré and Allègre, 1983; Hart, 1984] has been correlated with the Large Low Shear Velocity Province [e.g., Castillo, 1988].

Here we ask the following questions:

- § If there is a North-South increase in ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* across the TBL, what is the resulting plume conduit structure ?
- **§** Can this explain the bilateral nature of the Hawaiian plume ?
- **§** Can we predict the ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* variability of Hawaiian lavas ?



[Farnetani, Hofmann, Classs, in press EPSL, 2012]

Answering these questions requires some fluid dynamics

§ Laboratory experiments *[Kerr and Mériaux, 2004]* concluded that the Hawaiian plume should be azimuthally zoned



Without surface shear

With surface shear



[Kerr and Mériaux, 2004]

Note : colors are intended to represent geochemically distinct material

§ Numerical simulations [Farnetani and Hofmann, 2009] explored how simple Thermal Boundary Layer (TBL) zonations map into the plume conduit



200

100

0

300

Excess Temperature (°C)

400

500

Find: TBL zonation affects the conduit structure.

Modelled TBL

A linear southward increase in ²⁰⁸Pb / ²⁰⁶Pb* generates radial *and* azimuthal variations.

N

The 'lobate' conduit structure

A novel zonation appears: globally bilateral, but with high ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* variations in the N-S direction.



Modelled TBL

A linear southward increase in ²⁰⁸Pb / ²⁰⁶Pb* generates radial *and* azimuthal variations.

N

The 'lobate' conduit structure

A novel zonation appears: globally bilateral, but with high ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* variations in the N-S direction.

























The 'lobate' conduit: is this a robust result?



The 'perfectly' bilateral conduit structure...



What is the predicted ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* zonation across the melting zone of the Hawaiian plume?



We calculate the trajectories of passive tracers which carry a ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* value, according to their position in the conduit.



Melting zone: use dry solidus by Katz et al., 2003

We convert the ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* distribution inside the three dimensional melting zone into a ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* map.





Model predictions:

- **§** A globally bilateral zonation, with higher ²⁰⁸Pb*/²⁰⁶Pb* in the Loa-side.
- S Double-volcanic chains can reveal the isotopic zonation of the melting zone far better than a single, central, volcano.
- § A complex zonation induces a distinct temporal evolution for Loa and Kea-trend volcanoes.



²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* model predictions and observations: Mauna Loa



²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* model predictions and observations: Loa-trend



Post-shield lavas (Hualalai) should have lower ²⁰⁸Pb*/²⁰⁶Pb* than shield lavas.

This is true for both MaunaLoa and Hualalai shield lavas.

Used data: For Loihi, *Abouchami et al., 2005; Ren et al.,2009*. For Mauna Loa submarine, *Weis et al. 2011*. For Mauna Loa late-shield, HSDP *Abouchami et al. 2000*; historic and pre-historic *Weis et al. 2011*. For Hualalai shield, *Yamasaki et al., 2009*. For Hualalai post-shield, *Hanano et al., 2010*.

²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* model predictions and observations: Kea-trend



- § Hawaii Scientific Drilling Project (HSDP-2) : provides the isotopic evolution of Mauna Kea over the last 600 kyr.
- § Older lavas do have higher ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb*, in agreement with model predictions

²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* model predictions and observations: Kea-trend



The predicted decreasing trend from shield to post-shield is consistent with observations for Mauna Kea and Kohala.

Our model, with a deep (TBL) southward increase in ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* can explain observed trends on long time-scales (> 300 ky) for all six Big Island volcanoes.

Used data: For Kilauea, *Abouchami et al., 2005; Tanaka and Nakamura, 2005.* For Mauna Kea Shield, *Eisele et al., 2003; Blichert-Toft and Albarède, 2009.* Post-shield *Hanano et al., 2010; Abouchami et al., 2005.* For Kohala *Hanano et al., 2010; Abouchami et al., 2005.*

HAWAII

Deep mantle: a southward increase in ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* (green arrow) **Pacific plate motion:** N63W (black arrow)



GALAPAGOS

Deep mantle: a westward increase in ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* (green arrow) **Nazca plate motion:** to the East (black arrow)





Predicted zonation: remindful of the observed 'horseshoe-shaped' region of enriched material to the west



GALAPAGOS

Deep mantle: a westward increase in ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* (green arrow) **Nazca plate motion:** to the East (black arrow)



SOCIETIES and nearby hotspots

Deep mantle: a northtward increase in ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* (green arrow) **Pacific plate motion:** N63W (*black arrow*)





Predicted zonation: the volcanic chain to the north is geochemically enriched.

in agreement with Payne Jackson, Hall's work on Societies double volcanic chains [2012, submitted Geology].

SOCIETIES and nearby hotspots

Deep mantle: a northtward increase in ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* (green arrow) **Pacific plate motion:** N63W (*black arrow*)





Predicted zonation: the volcanic chain to the north is geochemically enriched.

in agreement with Payne Jackson, Hall's wor on Societies double volcanic chains [2012, submitted Geology].



Conclusions

The geochemical zonation observed at Hawaii, and at other Pacific hotspots, reflects large-scale heterogeneities in the deep mantle, source region of plumes.

The modeled large-scale increase of ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* in the deep mantle generates: (1) a *'lobate'* zonation of the plume conduit, (2) distinct ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* between Kea and Loa-trend volcanoes.

The predicted shield to post-shield evolution of ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* agrees with observations for all six Big Island volcanoes.





Plume ponding at 660 km depth ? Yes, BUT what is the buoyancy flux of the upwelling material ?



§ Our 3D simulations of thermo-chemical plumes show ponding at 660 km.

§ However, the tendril's buoyancy flux is 0.1 times the Hawaiian buoyancy flux (6000-8000 kg/s).

§ Recent 2D simulations by Tosi and Yuen show that, under specific conditions, also thermal plume can be bent-shaped. Estimated buoyancy flux 1900-4700 kg/s.



²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* for older volcanoes ?

The predicted decreasing trend from shield to post-shield is still observed. Only exception: East Molokai....





Molokai

na

West Maui

Maui

Haleakala

Koolau

West Molokai

Waianae

For Haleakala: Chen et al. 1991; Ren et al. 2006; West and Leeman 1987. For West Maui: Gaffney et al., 2004. For West Molokai: Xu et al., 2007. For East Molokai: Xu et al., 2005.

Testing the effect of a more westerly plate motion direction in the past



Direction of maximum gradient in the plume conduit (and in the TBL): N-S Plate motion direction: E-W. Angle $\Phi = 90^{\circ}$

§ Predict increasing ²⁰⁸Pb*/²⁰⁶Pb* for post-shield Kea trend volcano.
§ A possible explanation for East Molokai shield to post-shield observations?

Testing the effect of varying Φ present day plate motion direction (N63°W)

g

h

150



Φ=90° Parallel volcanic chains have opposite ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* evolution. A central volcano, equally sampling the two sides, has constant ²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb*.

Φ=45° Parallel volcanic chains are still distinct.

Φ=0° A new zonation appears. Parallel volcanic chains are identical.

Therefore, our previous results for Φ =63°, do not depend severely on the assumed N-S direction of maximum gradient.



Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

Earth and Planetary Science Letters

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/epsl

Mantle *P*-wave velocity structure beneath the Hawaiian hotspot

Cecily J. Wolfe ^{a,*}, Sean C. Solomon ^b, Gabi Laske ^c, John A. Collins ^d, Robert S. Detrick ^d, John A. Orcutt ^c, David Bercovici ^e, Erik H. Hauri ^b



3. Wave-path coverage (0.05-0.1-Hz data) at intervals of depth between 0 and 900 km.



162 160 158 156 154 152 150 148 146 Longitude West



4 162 160 158 156 154 152 150 148 Longitude West



0.5-0.3-0.2 0.0 0.2 0.3 0.5

168 166 164 162 160 158 156 154 152 150 148 146 144 142 Longitude West



168 166 164 162 160 158 156 154 152 150 148 146 144 142 Longitude West



168 166 164 162 160 158 156 154 152 150 148 146 144 142 Longitude West



164 162 160 158 156 154 152 150 148 146 Longitude West Geophys. J. Int. (2011) 187, 1725-1742

doi: 10.1111/j.1365-246X.201

Asymmetric shallow mantle structure beneath the Hawaiian Swell—evidence from Rayleigh waves recorded by the PLUME network

Gabi Laske,¹ Amanda Markee,¹ John A. Orcutt,¹ Cecily J. Wolfe,² John A. Collins,³ Sean C. Solomon,⁴ Robert S. Detrick,³ David Bercovici⁵ and Erik H. Hauri⁴



Figure 2. Backus–Gilbert resolving kernels for Rayleigh waves over three frequency ranges and for a given model error of 1 per cent. The eight kernels display the recovery of a δ -function at eight given target depths in kilometres (indicated by the numbers on the right). Rayleigh-wave phase velocity data at frequencies 10 mHz and above are capable of recovering structure down to 250 km depth.

Geophysical Journal International

Geophys. J. Int. (2011) 187, 1725-1742

doi: 10.1111/j.1365-246X.201

Asymmetric shallow mantle structure beneath the Hawaiian Swell—evidence from Rayleigh waves recorded by the PLUME network

Gabi Laske,¹ Amanda Markee,¹ John A. Orcutt,¹ Cecily J. Wolfe,² John A. Collins,³ Sean C. Solomon,⁴ Robert S. Detrick,³ David Bercovici⁵ and Erik H. Hauri⁴



Geophys. J. Int. (2011) 187, 1725-1742

doi: 10.1111/j.1365-246X.201







Figure 10. Model of shear velocity anomaly, dV_S/V_S , obtained from the inversion of PLUME data. For clarity in the panels, the subscript is omitted. The six panels show percentage perturbations to the reference model at depths between 40 and 140 km. The reference model is the modified N&F model for 52–100-Myr-old lithosphere (see text for details). The reference velocity at each depth is given above each panel. Different symbols mark the PLUME phase 1 (blue) and phase 2 (red) OBS sites. For reference, the sites of the SWELL pilot experiment are also shown (white). The phase velocity maps were not corrected for effects caused by bathymetry and crustal structure prior to the inversion.

		aii					
/g/s	8 -	Haw es					
N) XN	6 -	ques	(0			5	
cy Fl	4 – <mark>e</mark> ou	ville Marc Pitca	ago	es and stan		unio	nelen
oyan	Sar Sar	Louis	Galaµ	Azol Icela Tris	Afar	Re	Kergı
Bu	o 🔟						

²⁰⁸Pb* / ²⁰⁶Pb* of Loa and Kea-trend volcanoes

