# Mechanisms of Memory: Enhancing Retention Through Repeated Retrieval

Henry L. Roediger, III

Collège de France January 5, 2010





**ARTS & SCIENCES** 



Théodule Ribot (1839 - 1916)



Pierre Janet (1859 - 1947)



#### Henri Bergson (1859 - 1941)



Alfred Binet (1857 - 1911)





- Encoding: Original learning or acquisition of information
- Storage: Maintaining information over time
- Retrieval: Accessing stored information

# Keys to Remembering

- Recoding: Converting information from one form to another (e.g., from words to images)
- Retrieval cues: Prompts to permit access to stored information
- Repeated retrieval: Practice in accessing knowledge to maintain it

# 1 4 9 1 6 2 5 3 6 4 9 6 4 8 1

- Recoding: Converting information from one form to another
- Key principle: Convert information to a form that is easier to remember

# Squares of 1 to 9

1 4 9 16 25 36 49 64 81

# Effectiveness of Mental Imagery

- Three conditions:
  - Study 50 words
  - Study 50 words, but create mental images
  - Study 50 pictures







wheelchair

wheelchair



Erdelyi, Buschke, & Finkelstein, 1976

# Power of Imagery

- Students studied 100 pairs of words
  thumbtack pickle
- Two conditions:
  - Repetition or rehearsal: silently repeat words until the next pair occurs
  - Mental imagery: form images of the two words and have the images interact
- Test: Left word provided, recall other word thumbtack - ????



Bower & Reitman, 1972

# **Interim Summary**

- Recoding is one key to successful memorization
- Imagery represents one effective recoding technique for verbal materials
- Retrieval is critical, too

- Classic mnemonic devices (strategies for improving memory) supply both good recoding strategies and retrieval cues
- Method of loci:
  - Identify a set of discrete, well known locations
  - Place images of items to be remembered in each location

# Prior studies provided only one opportunity to learn

The typical experiments on learning offer more than one opportunity: Multiple learning and testing trials

What leads to learning?

#### WHAT LEADS TO LEARNING?

reading lectures studying reviewing

#### HOW DO WE MEASURE LEARNING?

quizzes tests exams

# Learning experiments

- Study material (S)
- Test on it (T)

ST ST ST ...

#### A LEARNING EXPERIMENT



**Tulving (1962)** 

# A CENTRAL QUESTION IN 20th CENTURY PSYCHOLOGY:

Why does learning occur?

A great debate raged 50 years ago: gradual vs. all-or-none learning

#### A LEARNING EXPERIMENT



**Tulving (1962)** 

### **FUNDAMENTAL ASSUMPTIONS**

Study episodes elicit learning.

Study - Test Study - Test Study - Test . . .

Tests are merely assessment tools; they *measure* what students have learned during study periods.

Are these assumptions correct?

# To find out: Manipulate the number of study and test opportunities

. .

50 word liet	<b>_</b>	cardinal
SU-WORD IISL	Birds	sparrow
10 categories		pigeon
5 items/category		bluejay
		robin

- ST ST ST ST 4 study, 4 test
- ST SS ST SS 6 study, 2 test
- SS SS SS 8 study, 0 test

Final test 48 hours later

Zaromb & Roediger





Tests

Zaromb & Roediger



**48 HOURS LATER** 

Zaromb & Roediger



Zaromb & Roediger

# THE TESTING EFFECT

Testing of memory not only assesses what we know, but changes it.

Many studies show that testing can enhance later performance more than additional study.

Roediger & Karpicke (*Perspectives on Psychological* Science, 2006)

## CAN WE MAKE LEARNING MORE EFFICIENT?

Standard condition seems inefficient, with repeated studying and testing of events that have already been learned.

- Develop a drop-out condition: Once a word has been retrieved, drop it from study
- 40 words / 8 trials, and then a final test one week later.
- Like the advice given for use of flash cards.

## DURING LEARNING, THE DROPOUT CONDITION SEEMS TO WORK BETTER



Faster learning, higher total performance. Students are perfect by the end.

# **DESIRABLE DIFFICULTIES**

Often conditions that make learning slower and more difficult enhance later retention.

What is it about the standard (study/test) condition that fosters better retention?

- Increased study opportunities?
- Increased test (retrieval) opportunities?
- Or both?

Paired-associate learning; 4 trials 40 Swahili-English word pairs Study: *mashua – boat lesa - scarf* Test: *mashua – ??? lesa - ???* 

#### Use all 4 conditions

Study all, test all	ST ST
Study all, test nonrecalled	$ST ST_N$
Study nonrecalled, test all	$ST S_N T$
Study nonrecalled, test nonrecalled	$ST S_N T_N$

### **LEARNING PHASE**



## **STUDENT PREDICTIONS**

"How many words will you recall in 1 week?"

All conditions =  $\sim 50\%$  (no differences)

# **ONE WEEK LATER**



Repeated studying after learning had no effect on delayed recall, but repeated testing produced a large positive effect.

# **INTERIM CONCLUSIONS**

Repeated retrieval is the key to long-term retention.

- Beyond some minimal amount, repeated studying does not much matter.
- Testing of memory not only assesses what we know, but changes it. The benefits can be great.

#### DOES TESTING REPRESENT A DESIRABLE DIFFICULTY WITH PROSE MATERIALS THAT ARE MORE RELEVANT TO EDUCATION?

Study prose passages

Then restudy or test (free recall, no feedback)

Final test: 5 min, 2 days, or 1 week

Roediger & Karpicke (2006, Psychological Science)



Roediger & Karpicke (2006)

### Summary

Testing effect does generalize to educational materials (passages).

Repeated reading leads to short-term boost, but testing enhances long-term retention.

Subjective experience (prediction of future recall) is inflated by repeated studying.

Feedback enhances the testing effect.

Effortful retrieval produces the greatest effects.

## **TRANSFER-APPROPRIATE PROCESSING**

Memory performance benefits to the extent that operations performed during learning are reinstated on a later test.

When students engage in retrieval practice during learning, they practice the same skill needed to retrieve later.

Potentially useful theory for educators, although it seems little used.

Does testing simply produce rote learning (as in "teaching to the test")?

Does testing produce learning that transfers or generalizes to other forms of test?

> McDaniel, Howard & Einstein (2009) Butler (2009)

Study passages, then repeatedly re-study or test Final transfer test (48 hours)

Prose passages that contain facts and concepts Initial test questions about facts and concepts Transfer test questions that require inference

Re-Study PassagesSSSSFinal transfer testRe-Study SentencesSSSSFinal transfer testRepeated TestSTTTFinal transfer test

Feedback was given after every test question.

Butler (2009)

### **Final Transfer Test**



Butler (2009)

### WHY ADVOCATE TESTING?

Testing enhances learning: Students engage in retrieval processes, practicing the skill needed to access information in the long term.

- Testing has both direct and indirect effects.
- Indirect effect: Increased studying.

#### DOES TEST-ENHANCED LEARNING WORK IN REAL CLASSROOMS?

Columbia Middle School project

6<sup>th</sup>, 7<sup>th</sup>, and 8<sup>th</sup> grade science classes

Some facts on each lesson are quizzed 3 times; comparable facts are not quizzed

Consider recall on tests at ends of chapters, end of the semester and end of the year

Mark McDaniel, Kathleen McDermott and Pooja Agarwal

#### **Within-Students Design**



Which type of material is easier to remember on a final test?



### **COLUMBIA MIDDLE SCHOOL PROJECT** 8<sup>TH</sup> **GRADE SCIENCE**



# CONCLUSIONS

- Repeated retrieval is the key to long-term retention
- This research represents a new way to look at the learning process retrieving can enhance retention more than studying
- Effortful retrieval and feedback on tests are critical
- Important educational implications flow from the power of testing or repeated retrieval as a mnemonic technique.
- Self-testing should be incorporated into students' study strategies.

## "Exercise in repeatedly recalling a thing strengthens the memory"

Aristotle, De Memoria et Reminiscentia

# **SPONSORS**

#### James S. McDonnell Foundation

#### Institute of Education Sciences



### THANKS TO MANY COLLABORATORS

Pooja Agarwal Dave Balota Andrew Butler Jason Chan Jan Duchek Larry Jacoby Sean Kang Jeff Karpicke

Jes Logan Doug Larsen **Beth Marsh** Jane McConnell Mark McDaniel Kathleen McDermott Karl Szpunar Franklin Zaromb

